



Criteria Defining Excellence

A Guide for Basic Scientists, Clinical Educators & Research Faculty

The following metrics are to be used as a resource to guide faculty members and chairs in the Promotion and Tenure application process.

- For promotion to Associate Professor, candidates should demonstrate evidence of a regional or national reputation.
- For promotion to Professor, candidates should demonstrate evidence of a national or international reputation, enhanced subsequent to promotion to Associate Professor.
- For award of Tenure, candidates should demonstrate evidence of a regional or national reputation as well as evidence that they can sustain this level of excellence and continue to develop professionally.

The specific criteria are meant to be illustrative, **not** exhaustive. Furthermore, the criteria are not listed in order of importance.

Criteria such as these are most helpful in defining excellence in the areas where the candidate devotes the greatest amount of effort as defined in their annual activity plans. Many of these criteria may reflect excellence in more than one area.

BASIC SCIENTIST METRICS	
TEACHING	Evidence/Metrics
Medical school teaching including lectures as well as participation in small group conferences, case studies, laboratories, SimMan demonstrations, team-based learning exercises, etc.; undergraduate/graduate school teaching, including lectures as well as participation in laboratories, journal clubs, etc.	contact hours
Weighting should take into account whether or not evaluations reflect all or only a portion of teaching activities; medical student evaluations often do not reflect all of a faculty member's activities and graduate classes often do not have a formal evaluation process; letters from block/course directors should be viewed as an important means of evaluating faculty teaching performance	student evaluations peer evaluations teaching awards/nominations
E.W. Richardson Excellence in Teaching Award, Health Sciences Teaching Award, Tibbits Award, etc.	teaching awards/nominations
UNR Med block/laboratory directorship, course directorship (undergraduate/graduate school); committee membership (e.g., Committee on Medical Education, Year 1-2 Curriculum Committee, etc.)	course administration
Participation or leadership in developing new curricula (at UNR Med as well as other institutions), courses, areas of concentration, etc.	course development
Development of new teaching methods, teaching materials, etc.	course innovation
Attendance at regional, national, or international educational meetings; letters from students and peers; course development activities, etc.	dedication to teaching
Seminars or other presentations at academic institutions; regional, national, international educational meetings, etc.	invited presentations



BASIC SCIENTIST METRICS	
First/last author publications dealing with scholarly activities related to teaching, citation frequency, impact factor/acceptance rate of journal; MedEd Portal submissions, etc.	original scholarly publications
TEACHING, <i>continued</i>	Evidence/Metrics
Trainees, including evidence of their success (publications, fellowships, research/travel awards, placement in academia/industry)	postdoctoral mentoring
M.S. and Ph.D. thesis students, including evidence of their success (e.g., first author publications, fellowships, research/travel awards, placement at institutions outside of UNR upon graduation); undergraduate students, including evidence of their success (e.g., publications, awards, acceptance to graduate/medical school)	student mentoring
Member or chair of M.S. and Ph.D. thesis committees	thesis committees
RESEARCH AND SCHOLARSHIP	Evidence/Metrics
First/last author, peer-reviewed publications dealing with scholarly activities related to research, citation frequency, impact factor/acceptance rate of journal; role in paper – when supervised student is first author, note this	original scholarly publications
Letters from “arm’s length” referees highlighting the importance/impact of specific publications, discoveries, reputation in the field, etc.	referee evaluations
Grants (supporting all scholarly activities, including teaching, research, or service) from government (e.g., NIH, NSF), private industry, foundations, professional organizations, etc.	extramural funding
NIH MERIT Award, NSF Presidential Award, professional society awards on research, etc.	scholarly awards
While team research is important, there should be clear evidence of individual contribution, originality, creativity, and indispensability (first/last author publications, letters from collaborators and referees, etc.)	contribution to team research
M.S. and Ph.D. thesis students, including evidence of their success (e.g., first author publications, fellowships, research/travel awards, placement at institutions outside of UNR upon graduation); undergraduate students, including evidence of their success (e.g., publications, awards, acceptance to graduate/medical school)	student mentoring
Trainees, including evidence of their success (publications, fellowships, research/travel awards, placement in academia/industry)	postdoctoral mentoring
Seminars or other presentations (related to scholarly activities, including teaching, research, and/or service) at other institutions, regional/national/international meetings, etc.	invited presentations
Organization of regional, national, or international meetings related to all scholarly activities, including teaching, research, and/or service	meeting organization
Service on grant review panels for government, private industry, foundations, professional organizations, etc., at regional, national, international level	grant review
Ad hoc referee, journal editor/editorial board membership, books edited	journal referee/ editorial service
Scholarly activities resulting in patents, start-up companies, consultancies, etc.	entrepreneurial activities
Membership on internal or external advisory committees, junior faculty mentoring, etc.	scientific advising



BASIC SCIENTIST METRICS	
SERVICE	Evidence/Metrics
A rating of "excellent" should require evidence of activities that extend beyond departmental and include significant UNR Med and/or University responsibilities; committee activities should also go beyond simple membership and include evidence of leadership, especially for promotion to full professor – this is particularly true if promotion is to be based on excellence in this area	departmental activities; UNR Med activities; University activities
Graduate program director, training grant director, participation in INBRE/COBRE activities, etc.	training program activities
SERVICE, <i>continued</i>	Evidence/Metrics
First/last author publications dealing with scholarly activities related to service, citation frequency, impact factor/acceptance rate of journal	original scholarly publications
Journal referee, editorial service, grant review, active participation in professional societies	professional activities

BASIC SCIENTIST METRICS: To be promoted from Associate Professor to Professor, candidates must demonstrate national recognition as evidenced by metrics such as the following:

- National teaching awards and nominations
- Cited peer-reviewed national publications
- Cited peer-reviewed teaching materials
- Work on editorial boards
- Invited presentations at national level
- Exceptional advisee achievement and recognition
- Recognition by national professional organizations



RESEARCH FACULTY METRICS	
TEACHING	Evidence/Metrics
Activities as outlined in role statement	Contact hours; student evaluations; mentoring; thesis committees
RESEARCH AND SCHOLARSHIP	Evidence/Metrics
First/last author, peer-reviewed publications dealing with scholarly activities related to research, citation frequency, impact factor/acceptance rate of journal; role in paper – when supervised student is first author, note this	original scholarly publications
Letters from “arm’s length” referees highlighting the importance/impact of specific publications, discoveries, reputation in the field, etc.	referee evaluations
Grants (supporting all scholarly activities, including teaching, research, or service) from government (e.g., NIH, NSF), private industry, foundations, professional organizations, etc.	extramural funding
NIH MERIT Award, NSF Presidential Award, professional society awards, etc.	scholarly awards
While team research is important, there should be clear evidence of individual contribution, originality, creativity, and indispensability (first/last author publications, letters from collaborators and referees, etc.)	contribution to team research
M.S. and Ph.D. thesis students, including evidence of their success (e.g., first author publications, fellowships, research/travel awards, placement at institutions outside of UNR upon graduation); undergraduate students, including evidence of their success (e.g., publications, awards, acceptance to graduate/medical school)	student mentoring
Trainees, including evidence of their success (publications, fellowships, research/travel awards, placement in academia/industry)	postdoctoral mentoring
Seminars, symposia, or other presentations (related to scholarly activities, including teaching, research, and/or service) at other institutions, regional/national/international meetings, etc.	invited presentations
Regional, national, international meetings related to all scholarly activities, including teaching, research, and/or service	meeting organization
For government, private industry, foundations, professional organizations, etc., at regional, national, international level	grant review
Ad hoc referee; journal editor/editorial board membership; books edited	journal referee/ editorial service
Scholarly activities resulting in patents, start-up companies, consultancies, etc.	entrepreneurial activities
Membership on internal or external advisory committees, junior faculty mentoring, etc.	scientific advising
SERVICE	Evidence/Metrics
A rating of “excellent” should require evidence of activities that extend beyond departmental and include significant UNR Med and/or University responsibilities; committee activities should also go beyond simple membership and include evidence of leadership, especially for promotion to full professor – this is particularly true if promotion is to be based on excellence in this area	departmental activities; UNR Med activities; University activities
Graduate program director; training grant director, participation in INBRE/COBRE activities, etc.	training program activities



RESEARCH FACULTY METRICS

Journal referee; editorial service; grant review; active participation in professional societies	professional activities
--	-------------------------



RESEARCH FACULTY METRICS: To be promoted from Research Associate Professor to Research Professor, candidates must demonstrate national recognition as evidenced by metrics such as the following:

- National teaching awards and nominations
- Cited peer-reviewed national publications
- Cited peer-reviewed teaching materials
- Work on editorial boards
- Invited presentations at national level
- Exceptional advisee achievement and recognition
- Recognition by national professional organizations



CLINICAL EDUCATOR METRICS	
TEACHING	Evidence/Metrics
<p>Clinical setting Evidence of excellence, impact and sustained commitment in teaching at the local/regional level; evidence of regular contribution to the development or assessment of educational programs</p>	<p>Cumulative number of learners; positive evaluations from learners at different levels (student, resident, fellow); table of evaluation scores; evaluation comments; teaching awards/nominations; letters from peers/learners; original teaching materials developed for learners</p>
<p>Non-clinical setting Evidence of excellence, impact and sustained commitment in teaching at the local/regional level; evidence of regular contribution to the development or assessment of educational programs</p>	<p>Cumulative number of learners; positive evaluations from at different levels; table of evaluation scores; evaluation comments; teaching awards/nominations; letters from peers/learners; syllabi; new course materials; learner performance on standardized tests</p>
<p>Advisement Advisement and mentorship of learners</p>	<p>Documentation of sustained contribution to student and resident advisement activities; number and types of advisees; advisee performance/outcomes; advisee correspondence; recognition for advisement activity</p>
<p>Other teaching activities Conference/Grand Rounds; leadership of educational programs</p>	<p>Positive evaluations from attendees; positive evaluations from learners</p>
RESEARCH AND SCHOLARSHIP	Evidence/Metrics
<p>Mentors learners on scholarly projects</p>	<p>Description of learner projects; publication/recognition of learner projects</p>
<p>Other scholarship</p>	<p>Abstracts, posters and presentations at regional, national meetings; peer-reviewed and non-peer-reviewed clinical and educational publications (including ePubs), Grants, clinical trials, intellectual property</p>
SERVICE	Evidence/Metrics
<p>Clinical setting Meets or exceeds expectations for clinical productivity; meets or exceeds core measure and expectations for quality, leadership and professionalism</p>	<p>RVU dashboard/other clinical productivity reports; chair's letter; dashboard/score cards; internal and external Letters</p>
<p>Participates in QI activity</p>	<p>Description of QI project and impact/dissemination</p>



CLINICAL EDUCATOR METRICS	
SERVICE, <i>continued</i>	Evidence/Metrics
Special expertise or recognized excellence in an area of clinical practice	Development of a new or expanded clinical service; letters from health care providers; recognition by community; recognition by professional organizations; acknowledged source of referral care at local or regional level
<p>Non-clinical setting Evidence of regular and effective service to departmental, school, education, university or system governance or oversight committees</p> <p>Activity with professional organizations</p>	Letter from committee chairs; products of committee activity with description of role/contributions; co-chair or task force leader of administrative, clinical or other service units
Community engagement	Letters and program materials from community organizations reflecting support, participation and leadership of community activities
RESEARCH AND SCHOLARSHIP	Evidence/Metrics
Mentors learners on scholarly projects	Recognition of learner projects
Scholarship with national impact	Published original work, reviewer for a journal, presentations at national or international meetings
Research and grants	External grant funding, Educational research, Clinical research

CLINICAL EDUCATOR METRICS: To be promoted from Associate Professor to Professor, candidates must demonstrate national recognition as evidenced by metrics such as the following:

- National teaching awards and nominations
- Cited peer-reviewed national publications
- Cited peer-reviewed teaching materials
- Work on editorial boards
- Invited presentations at national level
- Exceptional advisee achievement and recognition
- Recognition by national professional organizations